

Minutes

of a meeting of the



Planning Committee

held at 6.00pm on 31 October 2007

at council offices, crowmarsh gifford

Present:

Mrs P Slatter (Chairman)

Ms J Bland, Mr F Bloomfield, Mrs S Cooper, Mrs E Gillespie, Mr P Cross, Mr C Daukes, Capt J Flood, Mr A Hodgson, Mr I Lokhon, Mrs A Midwinter, Mrs J Murphy (as substitute for Mr G Andrews), Mr R Peasgood, Mr R Peirce, Mr A Rooke

Apologies:

Mr G Andrews submitted his apologies.

Officers:

Ms E Bowerman, Ms C Crapper, Mrs S Crawford, Mr A Duffield, Miss P Fox,

Mrs S Mangion, Mr M Moore, Miss G Napier, Mrs S Osborne, Miss J Randle,

Ms C Scotting, Mrs S Spencer, Mrs J Thompson.

73. Minutes

RESOLVED: to approve the minutes of the meeting held on 10 October 2007 as a correct record, with the clarification that condition 7 of Minute 64 should read 'that the use of the building.....and shall include limitations on the retail sales...', and to agree that the Chairman sign them.

74. P07/W0989 The Top Yard, Oxford Equestrian Centre, Lower Road, Garsington

Mrs P Slatter declared a personal interest in this item on the grounds of a family connection with the advisers to the agents. She stepped down from the

Chair and from the Committee and took no part in the discussion or voting, but remained in the room.

Mr F Bloomfield took on the role of Chairman for this item.

Mrs E Gillespie, the local ward councillor, stepped down from the Committee and took no part in the discussion or voting on this item.

The Committee considered an application for alterations and conversion of existing barns and stables to provide four dwellings with associated car parking facilities and private amenity space at the Top Yard, Oxford Equestrian Centre, Lower Road, Garsington.

Mrs E Gillespie, local ward councillor, spoke objecting to the application.

RESOLVED: to refuse planning permission for application P07/W0989 for the following reasons:

1. That the existing buildings are in an isolated and unsustainable location for housing where access to public transport is limited and services and facilities are not available. The site and buildings form part of the larger planning unit of an equestrian centre where a comprehensive approach for the future of the site is necessary. Alternative uses that would comply with and not undermine sustainable development principles have not been explored. The proposed conversion and change of use to four residential units would result in an inappropriate and unsustainable development in the countryside contrary to PPS7 and Oxfordshire Structure Plan policies T1, G1, G2, and South Oxfordshire Local Plan policies G1, G2, G3, G4, E8, and T1.
2. That the existing buildings are not of permanent and substantial construction and that the scheme proposes significant reconstruction, extension and alterations which will undermine the essential character and fabric of the buildings. The domestication of the site in addition to the nature and extent of alterations and extension will have a materially greater impact on the openness of the Green Belt and the character of the countryside contrary to and Oxfordshire Structure Plan policies G4 and South Oxfordshire Local Plan policies G2, G4, GB3 and E8.
3. That the existing buildings are not of permanent and substantial construction and the scheme proposes significant reconstruction, extension and alterations which will undermine the essential character and fabric of the buildings, contrary to South Oxfordshire Local Plan policies G6 and E8.

4. That the design does not incorporate a sustainable design and construction contrary to Oxfordshire Structure Plan policy G6 and South Oxfordshire Local Plan policy D8, D10, T2 and EP7.

5. That the scheme does not incorporate adequate vision splays and passing bays resulting in an inadequate access detrimental to highway safety, contrary to Oxfordshire Structure Plan policy T8 and South Oxfordshire Local Plan policies T1 and T2.

6. That the scheme immediately and physically adjoins existing farm buildings which are likely to give rise to activities harmful to the amenity of the new residents. The proposal is contrary to South Oxfordshire Local Plan policies E8, EP1 and EP2.

75. P07/W0905 95 The Street, Crowmarsh Gifford

Mrs P Slatter resumed the Chair.

Mr F Bloomfield declared a personal and prejudicial interest in this item as a friend of the applicant. He left the room for the duration of this item and took no part in the discussion or voting on this application.

The Committee considered the erection of a pair of semi-detached dwellings with vehicular access at 95 The Street, Crowmarsh Gifford.

Mr J Hannigan, the applicant, spoke in support of the application.

Mr N Odd, local ward councillor, spoke in support of the application.

Despite the officer's recommendation for refusal of this application, the view was expressed that the development was not overbearing or out of character with the immediate area in Crowmarsh, it was inappropriate to rigidly apply the housing mix criteria on a gain of one house in this particular location, and that sustainable design could be required by condition. A motion to grant planning permission with conditions, on being proposed, seconded and put to the vote, was declared carried.

RESOLVED: to grant planning permission for application P07/W0905 subject to the following conditions:

1. Commencement within three years.
2. Samples of all materials
3. Parking and manoeuvring areas to be provided in accordance with plans before the development is occupied.
4. New access constructed before first occupation.
5. Stopping up existing access and reinstating verge.
6. Tree protection measures.

7. Details of proposed landscape works agreed in writing and implemented within 12 months of commencement of development.
8. No additional windows in west-facing walls or roof.
9. Details of windows and doors to be agreed.
10. Sustainable design features to be incorporated prior to first use in accordance with a scheme approved in writing, and thereafter retained.

76. P07/E1135 Bushwood House, Newlands Lane, Stoke Row

The Committee considered an application for the erection of garages, carports, stables, tackroom, machinery and log stores at Bushwood House, Newlands Road, Stoke Row.

Mr P Emmett, the agent for the applicant, spoke in support of the application.

RESOLVED: to refuse planning permission for application P07/E1135 for the following reason:

That having regard to its size, scale and height the proposal would be disproportionate to, and out of keeping with, Bushwood House. Furthermore the proposal would consolidate the built appearance of the site to the detriment to the character and appearance of the Chilterns Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty. As such the proposal would be contrary to the provisions of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan 2011, particularly policies G2, G6, C2, H13 and R10.

77. P07/W0803 Willowbank, Church Lane, Brightwell cum Sotwell

Mrs S Mangion left the room for the duration of this item.

The Committee considered an application to build a single storey porch to the front elevation and a conservatory to the rear, and to raise the roof to provide first floor accommodation at Willowbank, Church Lane, Brightwell cum Sotwell.

Mrs F Richards, the applicant, spoke in support of the application.

Dr J Mangion, a local resident, spoke objecting to the application.

Mrs C Collett, ward councillor, spoke objecting to the application.

RESOLVED: to grant planning permission for application P07/W0803, subject to the following conditions:

1. Commencement three years.
2. Matching materials - walls and roof.
3. That all roof lights shall have a minimum floor to cill height of no less than 1.8 metres.

4. No additional windows other than those shown on drawings.
5. A detailed scheme for detail of valley gutter and parapet.

78. P07/E1015 Essex Hotel, 149 Chinnor Road and 1 Bridge Terrace, Thame

Mrs A Midwinter declared a personal and prejudicial interest in this application as a former neighbour to the site. She left the room for the duration of this item and took no part in the discussion or voting on this application.

The Committee considered an application for the demolition of the existing hotel and outbuildings, the removal of an existing single storey extension to 1 Bridge Street, and the construction of two two-and-a half storey buildings providing twelve apartments, fourteen parking spaces and a private garden at 149 Chinnor Road and 1 Bridge Street, Thame.

The planning officer advised that PPG24 in paragraph 5.1 should read PPG23. Since drafting the report, he had received three further letters from neighbours re-iterating the comments outlined in paragraph 4.1 of the report, expressing concern about the recommendation given the number of objections from local residents, and requesting a deferral of the application as the notification of the meeting did not leave adequate time to make arrangements to attend the meeting. The officer also recommended an additional condition requiring details of waste collection to be agreed prior to commencement of the development.

Mrs B Dobie, representative of Thame Town Council, spoke objecting to the application.

Mr N Lyzba, agent for the applicant, spoke in support of the application.

RESOLVED: to authorise the Head of Planning and Building Control to grant planning permission for application P07/E1015 subject to the prior completion of an appropriate planning obligation with the County Council to ensure infrastructure payments are made towards education, libraries, waste management, a museum resource centre and social and health care provision and the following conditions:

1. Commencement three years.
2. Samples of all materials.
3. Windows and external doors to specification.
4. Fix and obscure glaze windows.
5. Landscaping scheme to include the provision of tree pits to the new trees.
6. Surface water drainage scheme.
7. Foul drainage scheme.
8. Scheme for energy and water conservation to be generally in accordance with the design and access statement.

9. No construction works outside the hours of 07.30 to 18.00 Monday to Friday and 08.00 to 13.00 on Saturdays. No works on Sundays or Bank Holidays.
10. Scheme for lighting.
11. Measures to control contamination.
12. If contamination found scheme for remediation.
13. Layout of parking area in accordance with approved plan prior to first occupation.
14. Bat control measures.
15. Provision of bat boxes.
16. Scheme for waste collection.

In the event that the required planning obligation is not in place by 14 November 2007, then planning permission could be refused for the following reason:

that the development will place additional strain on existing community infrastructure contrary to Policy D10 of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan 2011.

79. P07/E1136/RET Station News, 20 Station Road, Henley on Thames

The Committee considered a retrospective application for planning permission for the retention of one existing refrigeration unit and replacement of another refrigeration unit externally mounted on the rear wall of the property and a 2m high enclosing fence at 20 Station Road, Henley on Thames

RESOLVED: to grant planning permission for application P07/E1136/RET subject to the following conditions:

1. The refrigeration units must not operate except between the hours of 07:00 and 22:30 on any day.
2. The rated noise level produced by the units in total must not exceed 45 dB(a). The measurements and rating of the noise shall be in accordance with BS 4142 (1997), 'Method for rating industrial noise affecting mixed residential and industrial areas'. The measurements are to be taken adjacent to the nearest ground floor flat at Hewgate Court.
3. The redundant air conditioning unit is to be removed within one month of the date of this permission.
4. Refrigeration unit (model number JEH-0300-M-1) to be removed within 1 month of the date of this permission.
5. A two metre high wooden fence shall be erected in the position shown on the submitted plans within one month of the date of this permission and shall be retained as such and the fence shall be painted white and maintained as such so as to be in keeping with the character and appearance of the area.

80. P07/W0993 and P07/W0994/LB Stones Farm, Little Haseley

The Committee considered applications for planning permission and listed building consent for alterations to the main house, guest barn and coach house, the erection of a new pool building on the site of a former barn, new garden shelter and associated landscape works at Stones Farm, Little Haseley.

Mr D Simcox, representative of Great Haseley Parish Council, spoke objecting to the application.

Mrs Greenall, local residents, spoke objecting to the application.

Mr P Dean and Mr F Dixon, agents for the applicant, spoke in support of the application.

Mr J Nowell-Smith, local ward councillor, spoke about the application.

RESOLVED: to grant planning permission for application P07/W0993 subject to the receipt of satisfactory details regarding a bat access point and dedicated bat roost area in the loft space of the main house and subject to the following conditions:

1. Commencement three years.
2. New works to match existing.
3. Sample materials.
4. Sample panel of stonework.
5. Specification of doors and windows.
6. Long straw for thatched roof.
7. Retain existing doors. Details of fire proofing required.
8. Landscaping.

and to grant listed building consent for application P07/W0994/LB with the following conditions:

1. Commencement listed building consent three years.
2. New works to match existing.
3. Sample materials.
4. Sample panel of stonework.
5. Specification of doors and windows.
6. Long straw for thatched roof.
7. Retain existing doors. Details of fire proofing required.

81. P06/W0535 Land between 32 and 36 High Street, Dorchester on Thames

Mr F Bloomfield declared a personal and prejudicial interest in this item as he had an interest in Trident Construction. He left the room for the duration of this item and took no part in the discussion or voting on this application.

Mr P Cross, a local ward councillor, stepped down from the Committee and took no part in the discussion or voting on this item.

The Committee considered an application for the demolition of existing timber workshops and the construction of two pairs of two storey semi detached houses with a single garage, seven parking spaces and associated access at land between 32 and 36 High Street, Dorchester on Thames.

Mr C Hill, representative of Dorchester on Thames Parish Council, spoke in support of the application.

Mr A Watson, agent for the applicant, spoke in support of the application.

Mr P Cross, local ward councillor, spoke about the application.

The Planning Officer requested that the second refusal reason be amended to remove the words between '...alternative employment uses' and '...there are no very special circumstances', and that an additional reason for refusal, that the proposal was contrary to CON11 and the development would potentially harm the archaeological deposits underlying the site, should be included.

A motion to refuse planning permission with these amendments, on being proposed, seconded and put, was declared carried.

RESOLVED: to refuse planning permission for application P06/W0535 for the following reasons:

1. The proposed development is of a suburban form and layout that is out of scale and keeping with the historic character of this part of the Dorchester Conservation Area. It fails to promote local distinctiveness and would detract significantly from the character and appearance of the area and the setting of nearby listed buildings. As such the proposal would be contrary to Policies G2, G6, D1, CON7, CON10, H5 (H4 criteria) of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan, the advice contained in Planning Policy Guidance Note 3 'Housing' and the advice contained in the South Oxfordshire Design Guide.

2. The proposal would be contrary to Policy E6 of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan. Policy E6 aims to retain buildings and land in employment use, unless the existing use is not viable or giving rise to nuisance, to ensure that communities can provide employment opportunities for local residents and be sustainable. The site is currently in use as a workshop without

giving rise to nuisance and no evidence has been submitted that the site is not viable or has been marketed for other alternative employment uses. There are no very special circumstances to justify granting planning permission.

3. That notwithstanding the objection in principle the proposal fails to provide an adequate range of dwelling type and size to meet the identified housing need in the District, contrary to Policy H7 of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan.

4. That, having regard to the location of unit 1, in the long term there is likely to be pressure from residents of unit 1 for the removal or reduction of the Sophora Japonica tree, which lies outside the site in Crown Lane, because of its positioning relation to the private rear garden area. Its loss would detract from the character of the area. As such, the proposal would be contrary to Policies G2 and C9 of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan.

5. That having regard to the siting of the proposed dwellings in relation to that of surrounding buildings, the proposal would result in unneighbourly overlooking that would detract from the residential amenity of occupants of 9 and 9A Queen Street and 34 and 36 High Street. As such the proposal would be contrary to Policies G2 and H5 (H4 Criteria) of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan.

6. That there is insufficient information submitted with the application to show how foundations and services would be designed in a way that would not have an impact on nationally important archaeological remains within the part of the site that is a Scheduled Ancient Monument. As such the proposal would be contrary to policies CON11 and CON13 or the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan.

82. P07/W1013/RET 33 Blenheim Road, Horspath

Mr A Hodgson, the local ward councillor, stepped down from the Committee and took no part in the discussion or voting on this item.

The Committee considered an application for retrospective planning permission for an extension to the stable block at 33 Blenheim Road, Horspath.

Mrs H Palmer, representing Horspath Parish Council, spoke objecting to the application.

Mr D Birkett, agent for the applicant, spoke in support of the application.

Mr A Hodgson, local ward councillor, spoke objecting to this application.

RESOLVED: to grant planning permission for application P07/W1013/RET, subject to the following conditions:

1. The stables may only be used as specified in the application and for no other use, including commercial use.
2. The stable block may only be used for the personal enjoyment of the residents of 33 Blenheim Road and not for commercial use.
3. The existing trees surrounding the stable block are not to be removed.

Prior to the consideration of the last item of business the Committee agreed to extend the meeting beyond the three hour period in order to complete the remaining items of business in accordance with the provisions set out at paragraph 9 of the Council's Procedure Rules.

83. P07/W1014/RET 33 Blenheim Road, Horspath

Mr A Hodgson, the local ward councillor, stepped down from the Committee and took no part in the discussion or voting on this item.

The Committee considered an application for retrospective planning permission for a change of use of an existing building from an agricultural store to a workshop for light industrial use at 33 Blenheim Road, Horspath.

Mrs H Palmer, representing Horspath Parish Council, spoke objecting to the application.

Mr D Birkett, agent for the applicant, spoke in support of the application.

Mr A Hodgson, local ward councillor, spoke objecting to this application.

A motion to refuse planning permission on the grounds that the use was inappropriate in this location, on being proposed, seconded and put to the vote, was declared lost. A motion to grant planning permission, on being proposed, seconded, and put to the vote, was declared carried.

RESOLVED: to grant planning permission for application P07/W1013/RET, subject to the following conditions:

1. That the building shall be used only for the purposes specified in this application and for no other use whatsoever which includes no retail use of the building at any time.
2. Personal permission, that this permission shall enure only for the benefit of 'Cullen & Padbury Upholsterers' for so long as they occupy the site, and shall not enure for the benefit of the land.

3. No development, addition of extension shall be carried out to the building unless prior notice is sought from the Local Authority.
4. No residential use of the first floor of the building.
5. All trees and shrubs presently on site shall remain unless consent is sought in writing from this Local Authority
6. Use of open areas for parking, access, manouvering, loading and unloading only. That the open area outside the building shall be used only as stated and no storage of industrial or other business use shall take place other than inside the building.
7. Light industrial use only, that no processes be carried on or machinery installed on the land or in the building except such as could be carried on or installed and used in any residential area without detriment to the amenity of the surrounding residential area.

The meeting closed at 9.30pm.

Chairman Date